

## PEER EDITING: ANALYSIS/EVALUATION QUESTIONS

By Professor Cassandra Cleghorn, Williams College Department of English

Your Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Author's Name: \_\_\_\_\_

(Write on this form and on your copy of the paper itself),

1. What is the thesis of this paper? Underline it on your copy. How effectively is it stated? Could it be narrower and more focussed? Could it be broader and more thoughtful? How successfully does the writer stay with that thesis throughout the paper?
2. What sort of evidence does the writer use to support the thesis? Are there concrete details and examples provided from the work? Does s/he concentrate on theme? Image? Metaphor? Meter? Tone? Form? Could the writer have used either more or better details to support and illustrate the thesis? Be exact here; use examples. Name one or two things that the writer did NOT use to discuss the work, but which you think would have been helpful in developing the argument.
3. Does the paper have a line of argument? That is, does the argument build in a logical and cumulative way? Does the argument have momentum? Are there elements of the paper that detract from the argument and should be edited out? (Indicate these specifically). Are there missing steps which would tighten the argument and help its flow? (Name these exactly?) Are you persuaded by the argument?
4. How coherent are the individual paragraphs? Does each seem both to have a central idea and to connect to other paragraph and the thesis? Indicate two or three places (be specific here) were the writer could have brought particular paragraphs into sharper focus.
5. Comment on the voice of the paper. Does it seem appropriate to its subject and audience? Is the writer's diction clear? Are there places

where a “signposting” phrase would help to guide the reader? Provide two examples where you think a better word or phrase could have been substituted for the one the writer used and defend your choice.

6. In general, what do you see as the paper’s greatest strengths and weaknesses? How has the essay given you a new way of thinking about the assignment? Cite a particularly sharp insight or cogent formulation. What should the writer consider in revising the paper? Give the writer a sample of how a sentence might be improved.